

Postscript



Image from the exhibition *Subtle Thresholds*, reproduced with permission of the artist, Fritha Langerman.

The observing gaze refrains from intervening: it is silent and gestureless. Observation leaves things as they are; there is nothing hidden to it in what is given. The correlative of observation is never the invisible, but always the immediately visible, once one has removed the obstacles erected to reason by theories and to the senses by the imagination.

Foucault, *The birth of the clinic*. (1975: 107)

POSTSCRIPT

Trees, webs and explosions: The analogical imperative in the politics of knowledge

Fritha Langerman

AS A VISUAL PRACTITIONER, it is often asked of me how visual art is to be understood as *research*. Of course, what underlies such a question is the assertion that all visual practice is subjective and emotive, and cannot possibly be held to the rigours of other intellectual endeavours. Yet, as is suggested by the title of this book, *Medicine and the Politics of Knowledge*, knowledge is contingent rather than intrinsic. While method and structure are implicit within any inquiry, visual art has different methods and is able to appeal to allegory, humour and irony, tools that are not within the ambit of scientific discourses. It is also able to self-consciously reflect on its own practice and collapse spatial and temporal linearities by combining vastly disparate materials, images and references in ways that extend beyond regionalism and locality. The rejoinder to the probe is most often ‘that which can only be known through practice’, and while this may be becoming a truism, it suggests that art is a means of knowing that is deeply invested in active knowledge, in the experiential, the sensorial and the associative. Visual practice embraces a methodology that is at variance with typical textual arguments. It is syncretic, it layers, veils, creates juxtapositions and sets up a multitude of suggestions rather than conclusions. In accordance with this way of working, the text of this chapter darts and dives, making and breaking connections, and should be read in parallel with the exhibition images.

Subtle Thresholds, an exhibition of prints, objects and collections, is primarily concerned with the visual representation of infectious disease, both in popular imagination and in medical literature, and the language surrounding disease, which relies on the binary oppositions of clean/unclean, known/alien and sterile/contaminated. The history of epidemiology reveals the interpretation of infectious diseases in the West as arising from outside European borders – as immigrant, foreigner and invader – reinforcing what Sander Gilman (1988) refers to as the fixity of disease as a constant other. The installation reflects on how constructions of ‘difference’ have served to mediate the cultural and political understanding of pathology, and on the ways in which visual analogies of disease inform the

visualisation of disease as a space of separation through which the patient becomes identified by illness.

With reference to material drawn from *Subtle Thresholds*, this chapter attempts to identify how visual geometries operate as a symbolic rhetoric in knowledge claims, how they may alter the perception and interpretation of that information, and how schematic analogies perpetuate ideas about the world. I argue that visual models intercede with the world and become the seductive keepers of knowledge. The argument here ought to be read in dialogue with the larger project, which reflects on the politics of taxonomies and on the ways in which linear modes of representation and analogy emerged in book form and found their way into museum exhibits, and which asks whether the recent shift in the visual analogy for evolution from the tree to the web of life may impact on the presentation of information in museums.

Barbara Maria Stafford's book *Visual Analogy* makes complex connections between science and art, proposing that in Western thought there has been no language to describe resemblance, only 'an exaggerated sense of difference'. She writes of analogy:

[By taking us] to the associative origins of human thought, analogy offers a non-algorithmic technique for binding our perceptual system to our cognitive systems, expressed in terms of similarities and antithesis. Learning, in this development scheme, does not spring from a chain of reasoning, but from a dynamic back-and-forth motion among choices that embrace the entire universe in their scope.

(Stafford 1999: 176–7)

For Stafford, then, analogical thinking is a means of sense-making that is ultimately comparative and based in systems of equivalence; however, there can be no sense of similarity without the corollary of difference. As Stafford indicates, this has been the dominant means by which Western thought has been ordered. Analogy is the relationship between word and image – the proportion that exists between two things – a system of ordered relationships articulated as similarity in difference. *Subtle Thresholds* concerns itself with representational taxonomies, in which taxonomy codifies a system of order based on difference. The word's etymology, from the Greek *taxis* (order or arrangement) and *nomos* (law or science), suggests this to be an inflexible system, and one that is ultimately hierarchical. Taxonomic thought has driven the visual presentation of biological collections and display, both within the book and museums, and it has developed persuasive visual metaphors to carry these ideas.

As a printmaker, I have found that my understanding of the world and my approach to the construction of exhibitions is mediated by and responsive to the

underlying tenets of the discipline of printmaking itself. The print in book form has been instrumental in the perpetuation of linear models of knowing the world. Not only were ideas of classification, taxonomy and evolution communicated through the book, which formed part of the reproduction and replication of those systems, but underlying linearities were supported by the codex structure, presenting a constrained and hierarchical ordering of material, not least of all linked to its origins in the church. The codex book is both binary and sequential in its form. The symmetry of the open book means that pages are viewed in relation to each other, while the inclusion of the frontispiece and colophon in more traditional books 'sandwich' the contents between an explanatory narrative and a textual reflection. The conventions of the structure and divisions imbue it with a temporality, as, through a slow process of disclosure, its contents are revealed over time. Enlightenment thinking is inextricably bound to print as both a political innovation and a creative practice, as it suggests ways of influence and a pattern of thought that is, again, based on binary referents – of an archive and its text, of object and image, and of image and text. Print is always bound to an 'other', a state outside of itself, in a discipline of oppositions: matrix and impression, original and reproduction, negative and positive, oil and water, depth and surface.

Western knowledges have been plagued by a seemingly contradictory desire to represent encyclopaedic systems within formats that resist fluidity. This is apparent in the early medieval ordering system, the *Imago Mundi*, which aimed at representing a compendium or cosmology of the known world (the creation and the created) within a geometric order of concentric circles and associated numerical clusters of symbolic significance. Through brilliant, illuminated images, the conceptual significance of light as a vehicle of truth and spiritual 'enlightenment' was intrinsically married to the ideological position of the knowledge that this system chose to impart. The schematics of the *Imago Mundi* provided a reliable, if reductive, means of knowledge dissemination by which a closed, finite theology was communicated to those to whom the written word was inaccessible.

The symmetrical geometry of the *Imago Mundi* is a development of an early Christian ordering system and world view, the *Scala naturae*, in which the tree was a genealogical analogue. Pre-empting the form of Darwin's tree of life, *Scala naturae* presented a divine order of nature, dividing animals and divine beings along 'evolutionary' lines of divine ascent. This presented an early system of binary taxonomy wherein belief was built on the oppositional states of order and chaos; heaven and hell; human and animal. Early museums were informed both by the legacy of the *Imago Mundi* (an encyclopaedic system of human knowledge) and by a pansophic philosophy, the idea of a comprehensive knowledge, evidenced through collections, and linking the natural, human and divine worlds.

The popularity of the tree as an analogue spans cultures, religions and time, yet is traced most obviously to its antecedent as both the biblical 'tree of life' and 'tree of knowledge'. This dual analogy introduces both genealogical kinship and epistemology. By enjoying the fruit of knowledge, immortality was sacrificed and through biological propagation the first tree of kinship begun. Genealogy is encapsulated by the tree schema as it provides a clear system for recording both succession and relationships over time.

In communicating bodies of knowledge, science has often had to rely on images to carry complex ideas, and it is these visual analogies that hold persuasive power, occupying a central role in the formation of public perception. Images are able to mask points of obscurity within theoretical explanation and provide a unified gloss – an image of integration and completion, and an imaginary synthesis. The 'tree of life' is one of the most pervasive visual analogies and its strong graphic syntax presents two significant structural problems: its ascendant linearity and its branching, divisive structure. Both of these have legacies within colonial discourse and it is the inheritance of these analogies of Linnaean and Darwinian divisions and classification systems that have allowed for the separation into racial categories and types. Darwin's 1859 diagram of a tree to explain natural selection is vertical in orientation, recent time being represented at the top. It has been suggested that this orientation is not as much a feature of progress as it is an inheritance of his geological background, in that the vertical stratigraphy represents near time at the surface of rock formations. German biologist, Ernst Haeckel's tree of 1876, on the other hand, traces a deliberate route from monera at the roots to *menschen* at the uppermost tips of the tree. While more contemporary representations of the circular phylogenetic tree may go some way to overwriting this entrenched visual image, its structure remains binary, branching and, as such, differential. Stephen Jay Gould has written extensively on the representation of evolution, and in his *Wonderful Life* refers to it as an 'iconography of expectation', arguing that all visualisations of evolution reinforce a 'march of progress' and serve to entrench a 'comfortable view of inevitability and superiority' (Gould 1989: 28). He identifies each evolutionary tree as having two distinct morphological features: monophyly, in that each has a unique basal trunk; and divergence, in that all branches either die or divide further. He states that the false iconography of the cone-like tree of increasing diversity conflates placement in time with complexity and development in a judgment of worth. In echoing Darwin's description of life in *Origin of Species* as an 'entangled bank', Gould suggests that the complexity of the tree is possibly captured better by a 'complex bush'.

The topological design of the tree provides a stability and reassurance, as the character of organisms (objects) as singular, reliable entities means that they may be compared and organised with predictable outcomes. However, the oppositional nature of taxonomy, built on similarities and differences, is currently believed to be

contrary to speciation, which is both relational and contingent on space and time (Zimmer 2008). Also, recent developments in bio-informatics, and the rate at which genomes can be decoded, have allowed for complex interspecies comparisons to be made.² In the past few years, the results of these comparisons have caused biologists to question previous evolutionary, phylogenetic models, particularly the iconography of the Darwinian tree (Dagan & Martin 2006; Doolittle 2000). Lateral or horizontal gene transfer (LGT/HGT), observed particularly in microbes, suggests that species transfer genetic material between each other fairly regularly and that this is a fundamentally non-branching process, thus undermining the vertical descent/ascent imagined by Darwin. HGT allows organisms to carry simultaneous attributions (a partial snake genome has been located within the cow genome, presumably transferred by the action of viruses) (Lawton 2009), and although clearly the phenotypical expression and cultural understanding of individual species remain intact, their chimerical genotype undermines the belief that species evolve determinately from a single point. What this does is to dislodge the sanctity of coherent, independent entities, collapsing hierarchies and tipping humans from their apex. In addition, this may allow for the possibility of representing other complex behavioural interactions that may influence speciation.

The suggestion that a more appropriate visual model for evolution may be an interrelated network or web has implications for the interpretation of visual artefacts and visual knowledge bases, because in arboreal iconography, each node divides irrevocably into finite objects, whereas in web or net iconography, objects are fluid, and subject to reattribution and change. The reading of biological and biomedical visual and material culture may be subjected to the same revisions. In doing so, chains of reference may be unravelled and objects and images become ambiguous and multi-referential, this shift in design suggesting a major recalibration in the construction of knowledge systems. While this may be true, there is perhaps something more subtle in the oscillation between these systems that can be evidenced in the history of collections and display.

Since the early modern period, this history reveals the underlying assumption that objects are significant and able to convey meaning, and that their particular arrangement is able to influence thinking about the world. During the late Renaissance, objects were organised according to points of similitude; during the Enlightenment, difference became the primary organising principle. When examining a potential shift in the iconography of evolution from web to tree, I translate this as a return to an interest in the connectivity and similarity between artefacts rather than the divisive structures of Enlightenment order. The web allows for an openness and generosity of interpretation.

The part museums have played within the colonial project needs no introduction. The development of museums is often recognised as running parallel to the

rise of national and political consciousness, as museums were seen as a means of actualising power through object wealth. Similarly, collections were used to reinforce ideological positions that collapsed science into forms of social control.³ It is also largely accepted that science museums have a particular link to authoritative classification and valorised forms of knowledge, as they have promoted an ideology of progress and mastery over nature as well as appealing to notions surrounding beauty and discovery (Jordanova 1989). In this way, they intrinsically perpetuate the ascendancy theories embedded within evolution and tree iconography. The current ‘crisis of representations’ within museums has arisen precisely because it is acknowledged that museums have been complicit in perpetuating certain understandings of taxonomic knowledge and that the strong metaphors which directed previous curatorial and display decisions can no longer be used to interpret current theory.

Yet, collecting is not all bad. Collecting as a practice is deeply invested in ways of knowing and perceiving, and is reliant on a dialogical relationship between objects. Bruno Latour (1987) stresses that it was precisely the physical proximity of massed objects within collections that allowed early biologists to reimagine the formal and conceptual relationships between them. Sixteenth-century cabinets of curiosities (or *Wunderkammern*) were based on extreme proximities and adopted an organising principle based on resemblance, complex linkages and divine logic (Macdonald 2006). Objects were de-contextualised and ordered according to their ‘intrinsic’ meaning and symbolic value, and the ‘poetic’ rearrangement of objects was encouraged to provoke conversation and reveal a divine code. The contiguity of the curiosity cabinet was a consilience – a literal connecting of dislocated objects and specimens from unrelated disciplines. This may be seen as a precursor of assemblage, a strategy that will be discussed later.

Ken Arnold (2006), in his overview of early museums in England, points out that 17th-century education reform, which recognised the ambiguity of language and called for a pedagogy based on a system of objects, was at the heart of museum philosophy of the time. A language of things rather than words demanded a classificatory order and grammatology of entities – the emergence of display – and simultaneously required a new system of naming by which things could be unambiguously understood. The visual, thus, was held above the textual as a means of knowing. Within ‘houses of learning’ objects were arranged so as to make visual arguments, and meaning was entirely contingent upon the perceived relationships between them.

The shift from cabinet to museum has been seen as a change in representational spatiality – an epistemic shift as the move towards a system of order based on observation and physical evidence of objects (comparative binaries of observable differences and similarities) ran parallel to the development of institutionalised spaces of collection (MacGregor 2007). Objects were seen to receive meaning from their relationship to the rest of the collection rather than from their own intrinsic

value and were contextualised in comparison to others. Difference, thus, became the centre of taxonomy and classification.

This system of ordering again reflects the structure of the book, in this instance Diderot and d'Alembert's *Encyclopédie* (1751–1766), which aimed to classify and categorise everything about the known world. The structure of the printed publication had an obvious impact on the manner in which information was understood, its contents organised according to a tree schema of a 'system of human knowledge', broken into three branches – Memory (history), Reason (philosophy) and Imagination (poetry). The scope of the project allowed for infinite complexity and philosophical reasoning, and the structure of the book form introduced the notion of the index and cross-referencing. For the first time, different sets of ideas could be viewed comparatively, and, in doing so, the reader was empowered within the act of knowledge creation.⁴ This relative freedom to build associative relationships was not as easily realised by the restrictions of 18th-century museum display. This was more in keeping with Linnaeus's synchronous publication of *Systema Naturae* (1735–1767), which introduced the notion of a linear classificatory tree stretching from Eden until present time. In museums, the realisation of this intensive ordering and labelling project took the form of serialised cases that were able to manifest physically taxonomic knowledge. Rational, unequivocal labels bound objects to provenance and attribution. Sigrid Weigel (n.d.) believes that the shift in the 1800s from a classificatory system (listing) to a genealogical one (tree distribution) presents a tension between systematic and temporal ordering modes. She argues that while classification relies on the constancy of species (determined by difference), evolutionary genealogy relies on variation that allows for change (determined over time), and that these two systems are incompatible. However, Linnaean taxonomy, while not temporal, presents a tree-like schematic hierarchy of species that is implicitly developmental. Both of these systems rely explicitly on a structure of difference, and within that structure is a predictable binary symmetry. I believe that it is the predictability of this structure that has made the tree such an enduring icon.

Returning to the exhibition, *Subtle Thresholds*, the project rests on the belief that active curatorship is able to dislodge previous patterns of viewing and understanding, and that through finely orchestrated relationships objects can sound, if not speak, independently of any authoritative text. It makes reference to Linnaean taxonomy and cladistics, yet uses a lattice of conceptual and visual cross-referencing to undermine this oppositional understanding of species. Cultural and linguistic description and codification present humans as a discrete species, with defined boundaries. Yet, infectious disease offers a meeting point, as disease is not something distinct and of itself, but is dependent on a relationship between a host and an organism in order to exist, and is evidence of an ongoing inter-speciation. Once a deep connectivity between humans and other species is acknowledged, all structural hierarchies collapse.⁵



Images from the exhibition *Subtle Thresholds*, reproduced with permission of the artist, Fritha Langerman.

In order to disrupt the stigma and fear typically associated with disease, the exhibition embraces two curatorial strategies: wonder and layering. The light boxes and complex lattice defer to Stephen Greenblatt's (1991: 49) well-quoted notion of wonder or the 'power of the displayed object to stop the viewer in his or her tracks, to convey an arresting sense of uniqueness, to evoke an exalted attention'. The intention is that using this language as the interface between the viewer and the representation of disease invites a point of contact that promotes further discussion or investigation.

It co-opts layering and repetition of form through visual 'hyperlinks' to expose the interconnectivity between organisms, worldviews and mythologies. In acknowledging the history of the relationships between images and text, and museums and text, this project attempts to disaggregate object and image from text and label, allowing for a sensorial apprehension of the material alongside a more traditional reading of details within it.

There are three methods of layering. Firstly, there is a literal layering of images and objects. The walls contain eight discreet sets of images: shadow painting, a schematic diagram, chalk texts, Scanning Electron Microscope images of animal faeces in quatrefoil and trefoil frames, rusted and chromed laser-cut discs based on bacterial forms, a framed inventory of mythical diseases caught from animals, a 70-metre timeline and a set of GPS co-ordinates of disease outbreaks over time.

Secondly, there is a thematic layering that picks up different stories in varied forms. As an example, Darwin's diary entry of 1835 describes in chalk the moment of being bitten by the beetle known to cause Chagas disease. This date is picked up in a yellow signage plate giving the co-ordinates of Mendoza, Argentina, where the disease was contracted, and is further sited in the cabinets within a printed board attesting to Darwin's diary of health a few years prior to writing *Origin of the Species* (1859); in addition, there is a cabinet, sandblasted with a diagrammatic form of his tree of life, and in another cabinet old chemistry bottles are labelled with the causes of death of 15 naturalists, Darwin being one.

Thirdly, there is a layering in the means through or by which reading occurs: the reading of disease through distinct disciplines (for example, diagrammatical viruses are manifest in pharmacological laboratory plastics); the material through which reading takes place (for example, chalk texts reflect the personal, mythical and philosophical reading of the diseased body); the limited access to text (for example, the scale and height of the framed myths make them unreadable); the explanatory texts in the cabinets thwart analysis as they lose their numbering system and direct references; and animal specimens are labelled only by the diseases they carry.



Images from the exhibition *Subtle Thresholds*, reproduced with permission of the artist, Fritha Langerman.



In addition to layering, the exhibition co-opts a system of dualisms. The gallery is simultaneously read as a cathedral and as a laboratory. The angelic wings are constructed from silhouettes of art historical and popular images of healer's hands and, while the shape formally references a schematic tree, it thematically refers to the religious binaries of damnation and salvation associated with disease and healing. This work is paired with the 'ex-voto plague altar', which uses the negative form of the hands as a screen, protecting six bandaged, taxidermied animals (surrogate plague saints) from the viewer. Plague doctor silhouettes run across the top of the screen, making further connections to the bird as a prevalent and ambiguous metaphor within the visual iconography of disease. Laser-cut discs exist in two states: chromed and rusted; a timeline in the form of a printed ruler circumscribes the entire exhibition area and includes a biblical concordance of disease, literally running counter to a more conventional microbial history. The ruler measurements are indicated by a chordate species list, incrementally divided by microbial species in red; and cabinets 'contaminated' by language are tethered to agents of sterilisation.

The simultaneous co-option and rejection of binary structure is a direct response to both the tree and web as analogous ordering systems. The iconography of the tree is a fairly inflexible frame. In an extension of the metaphor, it is essentially a nurturing image, which provides shade and protection, yet its foliage may disguise its underlying structure. It is both ascendant and descendent, and its bilateral symmetry implies an inherent sense of order, whereas, if in a Cartesian framework, order is taken to be positive, the web has negative connotations. It is complex and disorganised, simultaneously fragile and furtive and, rather than inviting, is a means to entrap. I mention this as the multivalent associations embedded within visual analogies have import for their endurance as cultural metaphors. It is impossible to speak of tree and web without reference to Gille Deleuze and Felix Guattari's (1987) writings on arborescence and rhizomatics. Clearly, the tree corresponds to arborescence, a hierarchical organisation of thought, demonstrating centres of significance and subjectification. It is defined and connected, whereas rhizomatic systems take into account that ideas are dynamic. The web as a schematic of speciation may not correspond entirely to the rhizome, which is seen as fuzzy, indeterminate and, thus, able to connect to other systems, yet the sense that there is a wide scattering of knowledge, which slowly becomes part of a more coherent system, is certainly closer to the visual rationale that was applied to *Subtle Thresholds*.

A more useful trope to apply to the construction of the exhibition may be assemblage, and although this loosely refers to Deleuze and Guattari's (1987) term as a non-linear, fluid and adaptable method of knowing, it also has specific art historical roots. As a modernist device, assemblage is an extension of collage, and its extreme contiguity brings together a range of seemingly incompatible objects and images. Assemblage is synchronic and relies on the symbolic reading of relational material values and forms. Robert Rauschenberg is perhaps one of the most famed assemblage artists, combining found objects with printed material and paint. He relied on a vast range of visual resources or what Rosalind Krauss (1999) referred to as a 'perpetual inventory', from which he was able to create complex networks of associations. What this does emphasise is that visual art provides one of many ways of knowing. It is this active place of association, this productive space of emergent ideas that can be useful for the future of museum display. Assemblage is, of course, also an archaeological term used to describe a range of artefacts found in the same location or context – in this instance assemblages are seen to represent singular moments, cultures or industries. In viewing indeterminate objects in close proximity, assemblage suggests both a dematerialisation and an emergence.

Assemblage is sympathetic in that it sets up objects in relationships that shift their independent meanings to refer to the language of sympathetic magic, objects rely on contagion. However, the methodology of this particular exhibition requires there to be an active fragmentation before elements can be reconciled. Here, I have

chosen to engage a further analogy – that of the exploded book. Unlike Western science, which is predicated on evidentiary systems, and uses analogy as a form of persuasion, I am suggesting that art relies on an explosion of established systems. Through this necessary disordering of accepted structures, it limits the known values that can be brought to the reading and experience of the work, and this disorientation generates an active engagement. Powerful mnemonics are activated when the viewer is confronted with new visual evidence and the default position is to rely on those established, learned patterns. Accepting this process, particularly within the museum environment that comes with expectations, *Subtle Thresholds* set out to test the ways in which an act of curation is able to simultaneously absorb and interrupt the patterns of display and reception of information. In doing so, it creates a system that dislodges those strong visual prescriptors.

The exhibition creates its own index or lexicon, and texts and images within the cabinets cross reference and provide clues to other elements. It appeals simultaneously to the sensory and the intellectual mind, and, in being both immediate and associative, is both synchronic and diachronic. By actively engaging the viewers, forcing them to navigate and read the exhibition in a complex way, it is hoped that the structure of the exhibition undermines linear knowledge systems and, in its texture and visual richness, presents a seductive and persuasive visuality. It is this sensorial persuasion that I see as the agency of art in the politics of knowledge.

Endnotes

- 1 I use this term in relation to ‘network topology’ that shows the layout of computer or biological networks. The structure of the network demonstrates nodes of convergence and the map of connections between physical or logical points. Most often, this structure resembles the branching of a tree.
- 2 Ian Hacking, amongst others, has drawn attention to the manner in which a bias for tree-like ordering can obscure alternative understandings of evolution. His lecture ‘The Fatal Attraction of Trees’, delivered at numerous venues, traces the persistence of the tree over time from genealogical trees, trees in religion to evolutionary tree diagrams.
- 3 Collections allowed comparative measurements to be made between species. This enabled false equivalents to be drawn between skull size and development in humans and was used as supporting evidence for racialist ideologies.
- 4 Diderot and d’Alembert’s *Encyclopédie* is the subject of my *Knowledge Chambers* exhibition (2007/8). See Langerman (2008).
- 5 This assertion relies on contemporary literature that draws attention to the relationships that humans have with animals, for example, Donna Haraway’s *Companion Species Manifesto* (2003), Derrida’s discussion of his cat in *The Animal That Therefore I Am* (2008) and Donna Wendy Woodward’s *The Animal Gaze: Animal Subjectivities in Southern African Narratives* (2008).

References

- Arnold K (2006) *Cabinets for the curious: Looking back at early English museums*. Ashgate: Aldershot
- Dagan T & Martin W (2006) The tree of one percent. *Genome Biology* 7: 118
- Darwin C (1871) *The descent of man*. New York: Appleton
- Darwin C (2008) *Evolutionary writings: Including the autobiographies* (edited by Secord J). Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Deleuze G & Guattari F (1987) *A thousand plateaus*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press
- Derrida J (2008) *The animal that therefore I am*. New York: Fordham University Press
- Doolittle FW (2000) Uprooting the Tree of Life. *Scientific American*, February: 72–77
- Gilman S (1988) *Disease and representation: Images of illness from madness to AIDS*. London: Cornell University Press
- Gould SJ (1989) *Wonderful life: The Burgess Shale and the nature of history*. New York: WW Norton & Co
- Greenblatt S (1991) *Learning to curse: Essays in modern culture*. New York: Routledge
- Haraway D (2003) *Companion species manifesto: Dogs, people, and significant otherness*. Chicago: Prickly Paradigm Press
- Jordanova L (1989) Objects of knowledge: A historical perspective on museums. In Vergo P (ed.) *The new museology*. London: Reaktion Books
- Krauss R (1999) Perpetual inventory. *October* 88: 86–116
- Langerman (2008) *Of symmetries and oxymorons: The Knowledge Chambers 2008*. Cape Town: Michaelis School of Fine Art
- Latour B (1987) *Science in action*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press
- Lawton G (2009) Uprooting Darwin's Tree. *New Scientist*, January: 34–39
- Macdonald S (2006) *A companion to museum studies*. Malden: Blackwell Publishers
- MacGregor A (2007) *Curiosity and enlightenment*. New Haven: Yale University Press
- Stafford B (1999) *Visual analogy*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press
- Weigel S (n.d.) *Genealogy – On the iconography and rhetorics of an epistemological topos*. Accessed 9 October 2008, <http://www.educ.fc.ul.pt/hyper/resources/sweigel/>
- Woodward DW (2008) *The animal gaze: Animal subjectivities in southern African narratives*. Johannesburg: Wits University Press
- Zimmer C (2008) What is a species? *Scientific American*, June: 48–55

Contributors

Christopher J Colvin is a senior research officer in social sciences and HIV, AIDS, TB and STI S at the University of Cape Town's (UCT) School of Public Health.

Judith B Farquhar is the Max Palevsky Professor of Anthropology and Social Sciences and Chair of the Department of Anthropology at the University of Chicago.

Diana Gibson lectures in the Department of Anthropology and Sociology at the University of the Western Cape.

Donna Goldstein is Associate Professor of Anthropology at the University of Colorado, Boulder.

Oliver Human is a PhD candidate in the Department of Anthropology and Sociology at the University of Amsterdam.

Fritha Langerman is an associate professor at the Michaelis School of Fine Art, University of Cape Town.

Susan Levine is a senior lecturer in the School of Gender and African Studies, Anthropology and Linguistics at the University of Cape Town.

Helen Macdonald is a social anthropologist and a lecturer at the University of Cape Town.

Estelle Oosthuysen is a qualified pharmacist and pilot and an independent researcher.

Index

Please note: Page numbers in *italics* refer to Figures and illustrations.

- AAA (American Anthropological Association) 142
El Dorado Task Force Report 142
- ABCC (Atomic Bomb Casualty Commission) 132–133
genetics data 132–134
studies in Japan 145
- Academy of Medical Science, Tehran 71
- Access to Genetic Resources and Associated Traditional Knowledge Bill, Namibia 88
- Achmat, Zackie 6, 34–35
- activists 55, 56, 60, 66
- acupuncture 155, 161
- New Age spirituality in US 156
see also under Chinese traditional medicine
- AEC (Atomic Energy Commission) 130
genetic mutations of Yanomami 134
political pressure on findings 133–134
- African botanical remedies 7
- African knowledge 61
- African potato dietary recommendation 42, 44, 56, 73
- AIDS 1, 6, 10, 17, 57
denialism 7, 49, 51, 58
dissidents 6, 58
dissident science 35
knowledge claims 51
politics on national stage 33–35
status and TB sputum test 5
uncertainty about 101
- AIDS Law Project 61
- AIDS science 72
- claims, truth or falsity 48–49
mainstream and dissident 34, 37, 49–50, 57
in South Africa 34–35, 48–50
allopathic medicine 79, 94, 104, 111
alternative knowledge systems 37
alternative medicine 4, 44, 153
alternative remedies 57
- lamace, Ju/'hoan-speaking San 79–80, 93–94
search for healing 81–87
son Namsje 84
wife Xa//om 81, 82–84
- Amathila, Dr Libertina 90
- Amazon 123, 130–136, 140
measles vaccination programming 143
- oral histories and genealogies 130
- AMBA Pharmaceuticals (pseudonym), Mexico 137
anti-cancer drugs 137
- Area of Compliance 138
drugs for HIV-infection treatment 137
- American Anthropological Association, *see* AAA
- American Philosophical Society 142
- anaemia 131
- anaesthetics 155
- analogical thinking 174
- analysis, written 71
- ANC (African National Congress) 46, 51, 56–57
deployment of SANCO 52
Youth League, *see* ANCYL
- ancestors 10, 55, 60, 62
- ancestral knowledge of healing 60, 62–63
- ANCYL (ANC Youth League) 36, 46–48
- antenatal clinics 60
- anthropological scholarship 80
- anthropology 4, 7–8, 48–50, 65, 66, 153, 155
of apology 65
bioethical domain 121
holistic Boasian ideal 121
post-postmodern era 55
antibiotics 85, 111, 155, 157
intravenous, Thailand 156
- antiretrovirals, *see* ARVs
- antiretroviral treatment, *see* ART
- anti-tubercular medication 86
- apartheid 63–64
- appendicitis 160
- Argentina 11
clinical trials research 122
ethnographic field research project 123
HIV and AIDS treatment 137
- Aristotle 20
- Arrowsmith*, novel (Lewis) 11, 120, 123, 135, 143
characters 126–130, 140
- ART (antiretroviral treatment) 3, 6, 11, 41–42, 58
denialist approach to 33, 34
programme in Khayelitsha 58
- ARVs (antiretrovirals) 21, 26, 55, 69, 74
cost, toxicity, efficacy question 33
defaulting, reasons for 55–56
effective dosing 43
efficacy in children studies 35
legal and political battles 34
limited adherence 56
psychosocial criteria for eligibility 25
side effects 69
struggle for access to treatment 73
toxicity for food-poor people 65, 73

- ASNS (*Anh Sraddhā Nirmulan Samiti*, Blind Faith Eradication Committee), NGO 102, 104, 108
- Atomic Bomb Casualty Commission, *see* ABCC
- atomic bomb radiation studies 119, 130
 - exposed and control population data 133–135
- genetic effects, Hiroshima, Nagasaki survivors 132
- victims of radiation, Japan 140
- Atomic Energy Commission, *see* AEC
- auditing in medical practice 19
- Ayurvedic form of medicine, *see under* India
- azidothymidine, *see* AZT
- AZT (azidothymidine), antiretroviral drug 58
 - clinical trial ethics, litmus test for 125
 - logic of trials 124–125
 - trials in Africa 124
 - vertical transmission prevention 124
- Baba, Sai 109
- bacteriology 155, 157
- ‘bad science’ 137
- baobab oil and pulp, cosmetics market 87
- beetroot and garlic dietary recommendation 44, 73
- belief(s) 4, 101, 102, 153
 - Hindi meaning of faith and belief 108
 - language of 155
 - question of 107–110
 - visvās* (Indian) in medical treatment and science 106
- Belmont Report 141, 143
- beneficence 135, 141
- Beresford, Belinda 56
- ‘Big Pharma’ industry 58, 123, 136
- biocapitalism notion 121
- bioethicists 125
- bioethics 142
 - and biopolitics 120
- code for research 145
- dilemmas of scientists in global clinical trials 144
- interdisciplinary field 122
- of life and death 4
- biogenetic resources 88
- bio-informatics 177
- bio-material 121
- biomedical categories, global hegemony of 164
- biomedical interventions 59
- biomedical knowledge, opposition to traditional medicine 6
- biomedical paradigms 94
- biomedical pathology 164
- biomedical practitioners 2, 55, 66
- biomedical science 7, 62
- biomedicine 3, 5–6, 79, 121
 - global 165
 - and indigenous forms of healing 41
 - and political economy of health 153
- see also under* India
- biopolitical notion 120, 121
- bioprospectors 55
- bioscience labs 153
- Blake, Rosemary 63
- Blind Faith Eradication Committee, *see* ASNS
- blood samples 130
- bloodwood (*Pterocarpus angolensis* or *n’hàng*) 82, 87
- Borofsky, R 142
- botanical substances, scientific method for efficacy and safety 62
- brain damage caused by virus 55–56
 - see also* TBC
- Brazil’s Indians and the Onslaught of Civilization* (Rabben) 142
- breach birth 160
- Britain 86
- bureaucracy 24
- calories, lack of 44–45
- camelthorn (*Acacia erioloba* or *jànà*) 82, 87
- capitalism 121, 125
- cartoonists, protests by 60
- see also under* Zapiro (Jonathan Shapiro)
- categories
 - excess of 22–28, 164
 - individual patients into groups 22–23, 25
 - of risk 25–26
- CBD (Convention on Biological Diversity) 88
- CD4 count 26, 56
- cemetery 63
- Center for Drug Evaluation, United States 125
- Chagas disease 181
- Chagnon, Napoleon 4, 11, 119, 122, 130
- ‘Chagnon Critics Overstepped Bounds, Historian Says’ (*Science* journal) 122
- chemotherapy 3–4
- Chhattisgarhi, *see under* India
- child labour in wine industry 63
- children, ethical issues of research 141
- China 5, 9
 - after the revolution 159–160
 - classical medicine 157
 - clinical research trials 161
- communist theory 156
 - foreign missionary doctors 157
 - healing expressions 104
 - hospital care histories 161
 - introduction of antibiotics 157
 - Maoist scientific socialism 157, 160
 - Maoist social epistemology 167
 - medical assimilation 62

- phytochemical analysis 161
- project of modernising public health 160
- public health interventions 157
- question of medicine as traditional culture 160–161
- scientific socialism 156
 - 'scientism' 156, 157
 - see also* objects, Chinese notions; People's Republic
- of China, founding of
- Chinese national medicine
- claim to transnational value 164–165
- global science 157
- and Mr Democracy 156
- and Mr Science 156–158
 - political encounter with Western medicine 158
 - superstition (*mixin*) among the people (*laobaixing*) 157
 - see also* *Qi*, translated
- Chinese traditional medicine 61
 - acupuncture 155, 161
 - collective activity of knowing 163
 - 'eating of' 43
 - diagnostic outcome (*jielun*, resolution) 162
 - as 'experiential' 158
 - gods, ghosts, divination, trance 161
 - government support 154
 - herbal medicine and remedies 155, 161
 - pattern-classification of tuberculosis 163
 - 'pattern of disorder' (*zhenghou*) 162, 163
 - 'synthesizing thought' 162–163
 - traditional culture question 160–161
 - Western medical 'disease' (*jibing*) 162, 163
- church
- codex structure 175
- protests by leaders 60
- cirrhosis 162
- citizens, protests by 60
- civics and street committees 46
- civil society groups 34
- clinical research trials 2, 62
- contemporary ethics 8
- double-blind trials on human subjects 4, 11
- global drug trials 11, 124, 143–144
- HIV and AIDS treatments, Phase 3 137
- people living with HIV 136
 - oversight and regulation 139
 - protocols 136, 139
 - see also* under Argentina; China; Mexico
- clinics 15
 - and hospitals 94
 - rural HIV in agricultural region 16
- cognitive-scientific enterprise 19
- cognitivism 20, 21, 22, 30
- cognitivist approach 19
- cognitivist discourse 18
- cognitivist view of medical practice 15
- commiphora resin (perfume), cosmetic market 87
- complementary medicine 153
- complex biopolitical assemblage 101
- Congress of the People, *see* COPE
- consensus between clinician and patient 101
- control groups 4, 11, 123–126, 129
 - bioethical concerns 146
 - ethics of science 141–142
 - and experimental 120
 - human research 120, 123, 126
 - integrity and solidity 123
- and populations 119–123, 139
 - reductionist and potentially dehumanising 121
 - see also* human experimentation
- Convention on Biological Diversity, *see* CBD
- COPE (Congress of the People) 51
- corporate insurance sector 55
- crafts 80
- cremation as alternative to burial 63
- critical thinking 71
- CT (computed tomography) scan 86
- cultural anthropologists 121
- cultural beliefs 102
- culturally based genetic research (Neel & Chagnon) 119
- cultural relativism 65
- Cumes, David 94

- D' Alembert, Jean le Rond 179
- damage limitation 112
- Darkness in El Dorado* (Tierney) 11, 119, 120, 130, 135
- Darwin, Charles Robert 175, 176, 177, 181
- Das, Veena 65
- data collection problems 133
- Daughter of Spirit, Mother of Mine*, film (Frankenfeld) 61
- deaths 16, 63, 64, 84
- decision-making 4, 21–22
 - doctors' abilities 18, 19, 22
 - experts' techniques 20
 - see also* ethico-political decision
- De Kruif, Paul 127, 128
- Deleuze, Gille 184
- Democratic Alliance (DA) 56
- Department of Energy 134
- Department of Health 34
- examination for traditional healers 62

- Department of Health, Education and Welfare 141
- depression, social indicators of 56
- Derrida, Jacques 22
- devil's claw 87
- diagnosis 1, 17, 94
 - act of 27–28
 - archaeology of 2
 - contingent, material factors 15
 - intuition and 'methodological' evidence 26
 - notion of 'interpretive community' 24
- diarrhoea 17
 - as symptom of TB 26
- Diderot, Denis 179
- dietary disciplines 156
- directly observed treatment, *see* DOT
- discipline-specific intellectual guidelines 141
- disease, *see* illness and disease
- distribution of medicine, state's governance 26
- divining 71
- Dlamini-Zuma, Nkosazana 60
- DNA 80
- doctors 16–17
 - decision-making 18, 19, 22
 - diagnosis 28
- and patient relationship 101, 162
 - socio-economic conditions of practices 18
- DOT (directly observed treatment) volunteers 81, 85
- Dreyfus, Hubert 20
- drugs 121, 122–123, 137
 - 'foreignness' of companies 38
- regimes 156
- side-effects 158
- testing and ethical dilemmas 124
 - 'virgin' or 'naïve to treatment' bodies 125
- Duke University researchers 143
- education 109
- Efavirenz tablets, vitamin supplements packaged as 42
- Encyclopédie* (Diderot & d'Alembert)
 - Imagination (poetry) 179
 - Memory (history) 179
 - Reason (philosophy) 179
 - tree schema of system of human knowledge 179
- Enlightenment order, divisive structures of 177
- epistemology 2, 5, 8, 80
- history of 173
- and methodological assumptions 141–142
 - and therapeutic diversities 153
- ESR (erythrocyte sedimentation rate) 86
- Ethambutol 81
- ethical codes 143
- ethical gate-keeping 140
- ethical standards in human research 121, 122
- ethico-political decision 22
- ethics
 - debates 121
 - medicine for profit 4
- ethnic identities 48
- ethnographic project (Petryna) 122
 - support group for men with HIV 33, 35
- ethnographic research 10–11
- euthanasia 4
- experimental group 120
- experimentalité* 120, 140–146
- experimentality, Petryna's notion of 120
- FDA (Food and Drug Administration) 124
- fever
 - plant medicines for 87
 - tuberculoma and patient with history of 86
- filmmakers, protests by 60
- fixity of disease as constant other 173
- Food and Drug Administration, *see* FDA
- food insecurity and limited ARV adherence 56
- food parcels 44–45
- food security 74
- Foreign AIDS*, show (Uys) 56
- Forever Living brand, immune boosters 51
- Foucault, Michel, notion of the
 - biopolitical 121
- framing process 24–25
 - 'administrative frame' 25–26
- Frankenfeld, Henner 61, 67
- Freedom of Information Act 134
- From Revolution to Rights in South Africa* (Robins) 58–59
- funerary services industry 63–64
 - see also* cremation as alternative to burial
- garlic as rogue cure 56, 73
- gastroenteritis 17, 26
- Geertz, Clifford 119, 145
- Geffen, Nathan 57–58, 65
- genetic material
 - lateral or horizontal gene transfer (LGT/HGT) 177
 - vertical descent/ascent (Darwin) 177
- genocide, accusations of 60
- genocide-by-ARV accusations 38, 56
- genomes 80, 177
- geophysics 155
- Germany 1, 86
- Gestalt psychology 28

- global clinical research trials 119–121, 139, 143
 bioethical issues 144
 industry 124–125, 144
 global ethical guidelines 141
 global market 87
 global pharmaceutical company 123
 global pharmaceutical corporations 138–139
 glucose tolerance tests 130
 ‘good science’ 138–139, 142
 Gould, Stephen Jay 176
 Gous, Dr (pseudonym) case study 16–26
 government 15, 93, 153
 certification for traditional practitioners 159
 inept bureaucracies 140
 Guattari, Felix 184
 Gupta, Justice 104
 Gwala, Zebulon 56, 57

 Haeckel, Ernst 176
 Hassan, Fatima 56
 healers, healing systems, interventionist strategies 103
 healing
 indigenous forms 41
 local 94
 search for 110
 healing dances 80, 81–82, 87
 altered states of consciousness 93
 children 89, 90–91
 ‘drawing out’ sickness 82
 elephant and giraffe dances 90–91
 feminine power (*ƒaisa*, singer with *n/um*) 92–93
 heat/pain/suffering (*khúisi*) 89
 heat up (*//un//un*) *n/um* to heal 89, 90, 91, 94
 hot/trancing (*khui*) 89, 90, 92, 93
 !*kia* and healing 92
 songs and rhythms 91, 92, 93, 94
 spirits (*//gauwasi*) 93
T!ixo (strong *n/um* singer) 93
 trance dancing and states 92, 93
 women 93
 healthcare 2, 7, 55
 health knowledge 42
 health-seeking behaviour 102
 Health Unlimited, Namibian NGO 81
 TB outreach and education programme 81, 84
 Helman, Cecil 2
 Helsinki Declaration 125, 141
 herbal medicine and remedies 38, 65–66, 155, 161
 herbs, traditional
 chemical properties 60
 clinical trials, packaging, marketing 60–62
 national accreditation 60–61
 transforming wild herbs into tablets 66
 Hernandez, Dr Victor 123, 136–141, 146
 Hill, Kim 144–145
 history and formation of knowledge 155
 HIV 3, 5, 10, 21, 56
 alternative and traditional treatment 50–52
 causal link between infection and AIDS 33
 denialist or dissident perspective 33
 nutrition in combating 65
 politics of 50
 poor people living with 10, 72–73
 workshops and support groups 33, 45, 48
 HIV and AIDS 63
 activists 6
 clinics 16
 course on, Worcester 66, 69, 72
 denialist approach to 33
 efficacy of micronutrients and multivitamins 11
 medical professionals 139
 people living with 55, 136
 Phase 3 global clinical trials 137
 poverty debate 56
 social and economic costs 59
 HIV-positive patients 26
 HIV-related disease 55
 HIV-related pharmaceuticals 137–138
 hoodia 87
 hopelessness and depression 56
 hormones 162
 horn-pod tree (*Diplorhynchus condylocarpum* or *g//àqrà*) 82, 87
 Hsiang-lin Lei 158
 human experimentation 8, 121, 122, 123, 124, 126, 129, 139, 141, 144, 146
 humanitarian interventions, logic of 113
 human mind as machine 20
 human rights 74, 109
 Human Rights Tribunal 56
 human subjects research 143
 ethical pillars for 141
 ethical standards 121
 hunger 8
 Hutchisson, James 127

 ICH (International Conference on Harmonisation) guidelines 125
 iconography
 arboreal, finite objects 177
 of expectation 176
 web or net iconography, fluid objects 177

- identity production 109
 illness and disease 1, 8, 101
 aetiologies or causes of 112
 and dying, approach to 4
 fixity of, as constant other 173
 infectious 8, 10, 173, 179
 and mortality, coping with 8
 patterns 9
 stigma and fear 181
 and suffering, holistic approach 112
 symptoms as evidence of 24
see also sexually transmitted illness
Imago Mundi 175
 immune boosters 51
 see also Forever Living brand 51
 immune response 161
 immune system 17
 language of Rath and TAC 41–42
 role of nutrition 35
 immunology 155
 independence of thought 113
 ‘deep-seated public secret’ 113
 India 5
 allopathic medicine 111
 Ayurvedic form of medicine 159
 biomedicine (*angrezi davai*), English
 medicine 111
 black magic or witchcraft (*jādū-t, on*) 103,
 105–6
 Chhattisgarhi villagers 7, 10–11, 102, 107
 Chhattisgarhi *visvās* 110
 critical politics of identity 108
 divination to diagnose illness 104
 government approval 111
 healing at shrines 104
 herbal remedies (*jar++-bkt, +*) 104
 mantrā and ritual sweeping away of illness
 (*Jhār(-phkmk)*) 104
 medical pluralism 159
 Nav Bhārat, newspaper 108
 Nepalis *biswās* 110
 pilgrimage and propitiation 104
 priest-exorcist (*jhār(phkmkvl)*) 110
 religious healing rituals 111
 Siddha form of medicine 159
 therapeutic massage 104
 Unani form of medicine 159
 village healers (*baigā-guniyā*) 103–104,
 105–106, 107, 112
 witches (*t, onh+* and *t, onh*) 103
 witch killings 103
 see also language, Indian
 indigenous herbs 7
 infections, opportunistic 57, 65
 infectious illness, diseases 8, 10, 173–174, 179
 informed consent 122, 135, 143, 144
 bioethical concerns 146
 economic considerations 143
 respect for persons 141
 inhumane living conditions in Prussia 1
 institutional review board, *see* IRB
 international AIDS conferences 44
 vegetables in SA exhibition booth 44
 International Classification of Diseases 161
 International Conference on Harmonisation, *see*
 ICH guidelines
 ‘interpretive community’ and diagnosis 24
 interspecies comparisons 177
 intuition 5, 9, 26, 164
 iodine metabolism study for AEC (Roche)
 iodine 131 toxic substance 135
 lacking informed consent 134–135
 use of radioactive iodine tracers 134
 IRB (institutional review board) 125, 137–139
 IRIN (Integrated Regional Information
 Networks) 57
 HIV/AIDS news service 57
 Isoniazid 81, 85

 Janmashthmi (Lord Krishna’s birthday)
 celebration 105
 Japanese study 119
 Jonas, Hans 144
 journalists, protest by 60
 justice 135, 141
 and human rights struggles 65

 Kaesje, Ju/’hoan-speaking guide 90, 91
 Kailash, *see* Sahu, Kailash
 Kalahari lemon seed oil, natural product 87
 kaleidoscopic vision 66
 Kenya 59
 Khayelitsha township 34
 healthworkers 42
 interview with youth counsellor 46–47
 and Rath Foundation 37
 Ꞥkhomani San 90
 knowing 65, 153
 knowledge 5–7, 9, 16, 80
 academic industry 153
 domains 93, 94
 home-grown 57
 ideologies 156–157
 indigenous forms 38, 61, 153
 indigenous system 61–62
 and locality 155
 nature of production 122
 recalibration in construction of systems 177

- scientific concepts and principles 72
 systems 36
 testing 71
 transplantation of 155–156
 Western 175
 Kxao, local San teacher 90–91
 Langerman, Fritha 9, 10, 13, 99
 language, Indian
 blinded, shut one's eyes to (*andhā honā*) 109
 blind man (*andh*) 108
 deceive, blind, trick (*andhā karnā*) 109
 deceit, fraud, trickery (*chal*) 108, 109
 devotee and fanatic (*andh-bhakti*) 108
 meaning of belief 107–110
 technology of 55
Last Adam, The, essay (Lewis) 123
 Latin America 4, 5, 120–121, 136–140
 lemon juice dietary recommendation 44, 56, 73
 Lekotjolo, Nkosana 60
 Lesotho 56
 Levi-Strauss on Brazilian sorcerer 112
 Lewis, Jack 6, 57, 71
 Lewis, Sinclair 11, 120, 123, 129–130
 life and death 2, 4
 of individual versus life of population 22
 lime trick 106–107, 113
 Lindee, M Susan 132–134
 Linnaeus, Carolus 179
 local settings, constraints or possibilities 79
 Loeb, Jacques 127, 128, 135
 logical reasoning 72
 Lu Guangxin, Dr 9, 154, 156, 160, 161, 166–168
 causes of medical disorder 163
 object-on-the-move-in-translation 162–165
 synthesis of disease and pattern 165
 lung cancer 160
 Lu Xun 157–158
 Lysenko, T D 50
 macronutrients, lack of 44–45
 Makunzi, Lydia 61–74
 children's home 65
 chitibhunga (suffering from evil spirit) 67–68
 food-garden project 61, 65, 74
 orphanage 61
Twasa (training) 67
ukuvamisa (tell people what is happening to them) 67
 Mandela, Nelson 56
 mangetti fruit, oil and pulp as medicine 87
 manufacturing traditional products 62
 Marks, Harry M 124
 Marshall, John 90
 marula oil, juice and pulp as medicine 87
 Maseko, Phephsile 61–62
 Mayeng, Isaac 66
 Mazuru, Professor Gundidza 60
 Mbeki, Thabo 6, 33, 34, 36, 51, 56
 African Renaissance programme 34, 38
 African solutions to African problems 57
 HIV and poverty connection 65
 opinion of AZT 58
 measles 4
 development of antibody titres 131–132
 Edmonston B vaccine 130, 142, 144, 145
 epidemic in Venezuela and Brazil 123, 131
 Schwarz vaccine 144
 vaccination campaign in Yanomami, Neel's 130, 144
Médecins Sans Frontières, Doctors Without Borders, *see* MSF
 medical anthropology 3, 7–8, 102
 medical care
 and psycho-social care 61
 re-conceptualisation of 18
 Medical College Hospital, Raipur 111
 medical evidence, nature of 60
 medical examination, Baghdad 71
 medical-humanitarian interventions 101
 medical pedagogies 55
 medical pluralism 41, 79
 medical practices, current conceptions of 30
 medical professionals, protests by 60
 medicinal plants, *see* plants, medicinal
 medicine
 evidence-based 19, 21, 27
 packaging 62
 and politics of knowledge 3–6
 rules and regulations for distribution 62
 ‘medicine as art’ conceptualisation 18
 medieval ordering system 175
 memory of content and recall 72
 mental illness, undiagnosed 55–56
 methodological rigour 123, 126, 141
 Mexico 11
 clinical research trials 122
 control groups for human experimentation 141
 corruption in government institutions 137
 ethnographic field research project 123
 HIV/AIDS health community 136
 neoliberal deregulation 138
 phase-3 clinical trials 136
Microbe Hunters (De Kruif) 127
 microbes 162, 177

- micro-biological proof of infection 23
- micronutrients 11, 44–45
- mimicry with intent to reveal 113
- Mira, Dr (pseudonym) case study 16–28
- misdiagnosing patients 17, 24
- Mishra, Dr Dinesh 102, 104, 108, 109, 111, 113
- modernist criticisms 103
- modernist ideals of classification 16
- modernity 102, 109, 114
- Modern Medical Institute (Raipur) 105
- modern scientific medicine, *see* MSM
- Moleleki, Miriam 63
- monophyly and divergence of evolutionary tree 176
- Monwabisi (Monwa), dialogue with 33, 35–36
- mopane essential oil, cosmetics market 87
- Moral Economy of AIDS in South Africa, The* (Natrass) 60
- mortality and morbidity datasets 155
- Moss, FA 72
- Moss Test 71–72
 - true-false and multiple-choice questions 72
- mother-to-child transmission of HIV 57
- mother to child treatment plan (MTCTP) 60
- mouse-eared combretum (*Combretum hereroense* or *!kàbè*) 82
- MRI (magnetic resonance images) 86
- MSF (*Médecins Sans Frontières*, Doctors Without Borders)
- ART programme in Khayelitsha 58
- and Rath Foundation 50
- MSM (modern scientific medicine) 62
- multi-drug resistance 23
- multivitamins, efficacy of 11
- mural images of hope 63
- muscular dystrophe 105
- museums 177
 - cabinets of curiosities (*Wunderkammers*) 178
 - collecting as practice 178
 - national and political consciousness 178
 - philosophy of early museums, England 178
- N!ai: The Story of a !Kung Woman*, film (Marshall) 90
- Namibia study 79–80
 - foot-and-mouth disease 83
 - government and protocols 87, 93
 - indigeneity, debating 89–93
 - indigenous natural products 87
 - medical knowledge and contradictions 85–86
 - N/ami and Tilxe, healers 82
 - Naye Naye conservancy 83
 - political economy of indigeneity 87
 - protection of biodiversity 87, 94
 - protection of intellectual property rights 87
 - protection of traditional knowledge (TK) 94
- regulation of genetic resources 87
 - seeking diagnosis and healing 81–84
 - state health services 93
 - TK, knowledge economies and complexities 86–89
 - tourism 80, 87, 89
 - see also* !amace, Ju/'hoan-speaking San; San people
- NAPWA (National Association of People Living with AIDS) 51
- !nara* oil, cosmetics market 87
- National Association of People Living with AIDS, *see* NAPWA
- National Health Care Act 7
- National Human Rights Commission, India 104
- National Science Service camp 113
- National South African Traditional Healers Bill, Zwelethemba 72
- Natrass, Nicoli 60
- natural health remedies 34
- natural medicine market 87
- Nazi medical experimenters, Rath's comparisons 50
- Ndaki, Kanya 57, 73
- Neel, James V 4, 11, 119, 120, 121, 140, 141–144
 - anthropological subjects 122
 - career choices 135
 - doctor and geneticist 130–136
 - excursion to Amazon 130, 134
 - Japanese skeletal data 141
 - measles epidemic, Venezuela and Brazil 123
 - research agenda and behaviour in the field 142
 - separation of science and politics 134
- neoliberal global economy 8
- neoliberal globalisation 143–144
- neoliberalism 121
- neurologist, expertise of 86
- neuropsychiatrists 55
- New Age seekers 153
- spirituality and treatment of pain 156
- New England Journal of Medicine* 143
- Ngcwe, Nothemba 63, 74
- NGOs (non-governmental organisations) 80, 85, 89
- promotion of San knowledge and rights 94
- Nishad, Kulwantin Bai (alleged witch) 104
- non-compliance 7, 101, 102
- non-governmental organisations, *see* NGOs
- non-Western healing knowledges 153
- normative framework 19
- North America 5, 18

- N/um Tchai: The Ceremonial Dance of the !Kung Bushmen*, film (Marshall) 90
 Nuremberg Code 141
 nutrition and ARV treatment argument 74
 Nywagi, Phuzmile 50–51, 52
- Obadare, Ebenezer 59
 Ober, Dr William B 129–130, 143
 objectivity and scientific protocols 2–3
 objects, Chinese notions 165–168
 image we face, translation of *duixiang* 166
 learning from objects 166–167
 object (*duixiang*) 165–167
 occult economies 102
 Okeke, Iruka 59
 olive oil dietary recommendation 44, 56
 ontological issues/questions 80, 162–165
 ontological multiplicity 86
 opportunistic infections, TB in HIV-positive patients 16
Origin of Species (Darwin) 176
- pansophic philosophy 175
 paracetamol 87
 ‘Paradise of Wisdom, The’ (Ali Ibn Rabban) 71
 parasite burden 130
 pathology 9
 patients 66
 adherence 102
 traditional modes of protection 144
 Pauling, Linus 34
 People’s Republic of China, founding of
 legalisation of traditional medicine
 practice 159
 national public health policy 159
 paramedicalised practitioners 160
 socialism as ‘scientistic’ 160
 state control 160
 training of medical practitioners 159
 translations 159
 see also China
 performances 80
 Petryna, Adriana 120–123, 124–125, 143–144
 pharmaceutical activism, grassroots 33–34
 pharmaceutical capital and power 120
 pharmaceutical colonialism 49
 pharmaceutical companies 55, 58
 ghostwriting of studies 125
 profit-seeking interests 125
 products generating profits 137
 protocols in Mexico 137
 pharmaceutical corporations and protocols 136
 pharmaceutical industry 123
 pharmaceutical politics 120–121, 146
 pharmaceutical production and distribution
 Latin-America 120–121, 136–140
 Mexico and Argentina 11
 pharmaceutical science 120
 pharmaceutical technology 42
 photographers, protests by 60
 phronesis 20–22
Physician to the Gene Pool, memoir (Neel) 131
 physics, modern 167
 phytochemical analyses, *see under* China
 pills
 ‘naturalness’ residing in 42
 power of 37, 42
 size and similarity to food 43
 symbolic referents 43
 placebo, use of 124
 control studies 126
 effect 112
 placebo-controlled trials 124
 among impoverished populations 139
 global clinical trials 125–126
placere (to please) 124
 plants, medicinal 82, 87, 93, 94
 ancestral knowledge 62–63
 local community knowledge 88, 94
 in the wild and value of 66
 wild foods and fungi 87
 playwrights, protests by 60
 pluralistic medical development 154, 158
 pneumonia 162
 political economic analysis 56
 politics 3–7
 of competing AIDS knowledge claims 51
 of knowledge 56
 populations 4, 5, 17, 122–125
 post-apartheid era
 African renaissance 66
 of ‘reconciliation’ 63
 traditional medicine 73–74
 poverty 8, 10, 16, 56, 74
 power 8
 and corruption 47
 practical reasoning 20
see also phronesis
 pregnant women 60
 printmaking 174–175
 problem solving 71, 72
 prognostic dimension 112
Progress of Experiment, The: Science and Therapeutic
Reform in the United States (Marks) 124
 protocols, medical 15–17, 20, 21–2, 28–30, 60
 critique of 18
 and logic of the machine 17–22

- responsibility or ethics and politics 22
- universal 27
- Pruitt, Liese 50–51
- pseudo-scientific pariahs 50
- pseudo-scientists 58, 74
- psychiatric diagnosis 23
- public health 48–50, 101
 - interventions in China 157
 - policy-makers 153
 - protests by practitioners 60
 - sectors 66, 146
 - studies 155
- public hospitals, resource-poor 140
- Pyrazinamide 81

- Qi, translated
 - Chinese word and quantum physics 161
 - configurative force 161
- energy, matter-energy 161
 - heteropathic class (*xie qi*) 163, 164
 - and immune system 163
 - illness patterns (*zhenghou*) 163
 - orthopathic class (*zheng qi*) 163, 164
 - pattern of disorder and disease 164–165
 - wholesome and pathogenic *qi* struggle 164
 - yin-yang harmonies 163
- Quackdown, website 57–58, 61
- quackery 102, 113

- Rabban, Ali Ibn, Persian physician 71
- Rabben, Linda 142
- radiation 160
- randomised, controlled trial, *see* RCT
- Rath, Dr Matthias 11, 33, 50, 51, 57, 74
 - alternative treatment programme 35
 - ‘clinical trials’ 37–38
 - enactment of treatment in practice 42–44
 - entry points and legitimisation 46
 - on ‘foreignness’ of drug companies 38
 - ‘junk science’ or ‘pseudo-science’ 37
 - local and national network of supporters 35
 - message of corruption and need for scepticism 47
 - modernity and indigeneity 38, 42
 - structural poverty and social exclusion 52
 - true believers and modern believers 41, 52
 - truth or falsity of claims 48–50
- Rath Foundation 34, 49, 52
 - at community level 35–37
 - conflicts, TAC and Rath volunteers 36
 - engagement with SANCO and ANCYL 46–48, 52
 - struggle against, in research and practice 49
- vitamin and micronutrient supplements 33, 42
 - see also* food parcels
- Rauschenberg, Robert 184
- RCT (randomised, controlled trial), double-blind 124, 126
- ‘real worlds’, plurality of 155
- Reason*. *Diderot*, etching (Langerman) 13, 99
- researchers, protests by 60
- resources, equitable allocation of 15
- ‘Retreat from Clinical Medicine’, memoir (Neel) 135
- Reynolds, Pamela 63
- Rifampicin 81
- risk 25–26, 126
- Robins, Steven 58
- Roche, Marcel 134–135
- Rockefeller Institute, New York 127
- rogue cures 56, 59, 102, 112, 113
- Rosenberg, Charles 128
- Ross, Fiona 63

- Sahu, Kailash 102–106, 109, 111
- Pott’s spine (tuberculosis spondylitis) 104
- Saidi, Dr Farrokh 71
- Salk Institute, neuroendocrinology laboratory 121
- SANCO (South African National Civics Organisation) 36, 46–48
 - political and social exclusion of members 47–48
- sangomas
 - degree programme, Wits 60–61
 - divining, diagnosis and treatment 62–63
 - hiding and finding test 68
 - Nandi’s dreams about snakes 68–69
 - patient to pay (*inicoma*) 67
 - photograph, Sangoma with trainee 70
 - professionalisation 66
 - Twasa* (training) 67
 - see also* under tests, nature of
- San people
 - ‘brand’, copyright, intellectual property 80, 89
 - ‘brand’ of healing knowledge globalised 94
 - children and village school 81
 - claim on land and resources 87–88
 - ethnicity and authenticity debates 80
 - Ju/’hoan healing dance 90
 - Ju/’hoan knowledge 10, 90–91, 94
 - Ju/’hoan-speakers 81, 87–88
 - Kxao Moses, councillor 83
 - ‘trance’ techniques 94
- satirists, protests by 60
- Scala naturae*

- divine order of nature 175
- early Christian ordering system 175
- tree as genealogical analogue 175
see also Imago Mundi; tree
- scepticism 4, 7, 40, 102–102, 110, 113–114
 causal link between HIV infection and
 AIDS 33
 about human experimentation 144
 hybrid or eclectic 103
 and notions of belief 101
 pragmatic and disenchanting 10–11
 trickery 106–107
- schizophrenia 21
- science 109, 155
 and art connections 174
 capitalist perversion 139
 corporate control over 124
 global 167–168
 mainstream and dissident 41
 methodology 26
 pre-capitalist 146
 ‘pure’ and ‘commercialised’ 126
 and TK 94
 used for profit 137
- science laboratory findings 128
- scientific definitions 72
- scientific design and method 120
- scientific medical practice 19
- scientific process 121
- scientific secular rationalism 102
- scientists 55
- Scholastic Aptitude Test for Medical Students 72
- Scripps Research Institute 94
- sexually transmitted illness 59
- Shapiro, Jonathan, *see* Zapiro
- Shikongo, Sem 88
- sickness, construction of 80
- social and political networks 46
- social sciences 1, 5, 101
- socio-economic constraints 18
- Socrates 20
- sorcery (*gawau xai*) 82
- sourplum (*Ximenia caffra* or *g/ooeh*) 82
- South Africa 6–7, 15, 56, 86
 conditions of life in townships 47
 economists and sociologists 59
 Global Fund 29
 HIV-positive people 23
 national medical exams 72
- South African AIDS conference, International
 Conference
 Centre, Durban 57
- South African Civics Organisation, *see* SANCO
- South African Healers Association 69
- South African Museum of Natural History 9
- South Americans, native tropical 144
- Spencer, Warren P 135
- spiritual forms of healing 40
- sputum 16–17, 81, 86, 87
- Stafford, Barbara Maria 174
- standardisation 15, 17, 21, 22, 24, 27, 28–30
 intuition and excess problems 164
 of medicine and protocols 28–29
- state, the 46, 55, 66, 93, 94
 administrative orders 18, 25
- ownership of biogenetic resources 88
 and public service development
 projects 47
 resources and training, access to 66
- statistico-HIV 23
- statistico-HIV/tuberculosis XDR 23
- statistico-tuberculosis concept 23
- Steinberg, Jonny 65
- Stern, Curt 135
- stigma 56
 people with TB 84
- street committees 46
- sub-Saharan Africa, HIV-positive population 23
- Subtle Thresholds* (Langerman) 9, 179–185
- images from Iziko Museum exhibitions *viii*, 14,
 32, 54, 78, 100,
 118, 152, 172, 180, 182, 183
- Suburban Shaman: A Journey Through Medicine*
 (Helman) 2
- Suffering Made Real: American Science and the
 Survivors
 at Hiroshima* (Lindee) 132–134
- suicide 4, 24
- superstition 5, 113
- belief and scepticism 102–103
andhvisvās (Indian) 104, 106, 108, 109
- surgery 158, 160
- syphilis disease 161
- Systema Naturae* (Linnaeus) 179
- systematic and temporal ordering modes 179
- TAC (Treatment Action Campaign) 6, 34, 51, 56,
 57–58, 61
 advocacy for free access to ART 33
 ART programme in Khayelitsha 58
- battle with Rath Foundation 34
 campaign and public health advocates 35
 comparing Rath to Soviet scientist
 Lysenko 50
 comparisons between and Nazi
 ‘Brownshirts’ 38
 interview with volunteer 39–41
 Rath’s comparison of activists 50

- 'The End of the Matthias Rath Affair?', email 50, 52
- treatment literacy approach 38
- Taking HAART* film (Lewis) 6, 57
- 'Traditional Healers for ART' poster 6
- Tanzania 56
- taxonomic thought 174
- taxonomy, Greek meaning
 - and classification 179
 - nomos* (law or science) 174
 - oppositional nature of 176–7
 - order and chaos 175
 - taxis* (order or arrangement) 174
- TB (tuberculosis) 2, 6, 10, 23
 - drug-resistant strains of 101
 - in HIV-positive patients 16
 - medication 17
 - NGO's responsibility 85
- nutrition, hunger, smoking, labour 84
 - plant medicines for 86–87
 - poor people living with 10
 - prevalence among San children 84
 - prevalence among San people 81
- protocol for diagnosis 16
- resources for testing and curing 24
- sputum for microbiological test 5, 16–17
- tibi* in San language 85, 86, 87
- transmission 84
 - see also* tuberculoma infection
- TBC, tumour-like growth in brain 82
- TB Vaccine Initiative 65–66
- T-cells and immune system 55–56
- technologies 20, 24, 94, 155
- Tejram, narrator 102, 105–107, 109–110, 111
- Temple, Dr Robert 125
- terminalia root bark 87
- tests, nature of 71–72
 - fertility, blood, urine, eyes 71
 - hiding and finding 68, 71
 - legitimacy of trials 60, 71
 - manhood, courage, fidelity 71
 - see also* Moss Test
- Thakur, Dr 104
- therapeutic regimens 112
- Tierney, Patrick 11, 119, 120, 122, 130, 134–135, 144–145
- TK (traditional knowledge) 80, 86–89, 94
- Tobacco Mosaic Virus 161
- tourist operations 80
- tracking abilities 80
- traditional healers 2–3, 6–7, 66
 - legal codes of conduct 6–7
 - natural, tradition, and/or African solutions 34
 - need for professional sector 60
 - role in HIV and AIDS prevention and treatment 57
- Zwelethamba township study 55–56
- Traditional Healers' Association 61–62, 72
- Traditional Healers Organisation, South Africa 37, 74
- traditional healing 40, 153
 - professionalisation 60–63
- Traditional Health Practitioners Act 57, 66
- traditional knowledge, *see* TK
- traditional medicine, *see* TRM
- traditional plants, Eastern Cape 65–66
- transcendental meditation 155
- transformation
 - multifaceted 29–30, 156
 - risks and promises 162
- translation 156
 - circumstances of Euro-American sciences 157
 - questions of 8–11, 154
 - transportation or globalization of languages 29
 - twentieth-century era and biomedicine 159–160
- treatment
 - adherence and compliance 101
 - alternatives 41
- Treatment Action Campaign, *see* TAC
- treatment-naïve populations for research 139
- tree
 - arborescence and rhizomatics 184
 - biblical tree of life 176
 - Darwin's tree of life 175, 177
 - evolution, shift from web to tree 177
 - geneology and tree schema 176
 - Gould's evolutionary tree 176
 - Haeckel's tree 176
 - of kinship 176
 - of knowledge 176
 - phylogenetic tree 176
 - and web as analogous ordering systems 184
 - see also* visual analogies; web or net iconography
- triaging care 160
- trickery 113
 - mimicry with intent to reveal 113
- TRM (traditional medicine) 2–3, 5, 10, 55–57, 60, 62
 - legal codes of conduct 6–7
 - modernisation of 66
- Tshabalala-Msimang, Manto 33, 44, 56, 57, 73–74
 - nutrition instead of ARV treatment 56
- tuberculin test 86
- tuberculoma infection 79–80

- diagnosis 86
- TB micro-bacteria in brain 80
- tuberculosis, *see* TB
- typhus epidemic, Upper Silesia 1

- Ubhejane, herbal 'remedy' 56, 60, 61, 65, 69
- university, role of 37, 48–50
- University of the Western Cape 79
- University of the Witwatersrand, *see* Wits
- Uys, Pieter Dirk 56

- vaccines, *see under* measles
- Vedic astrologers 109
- Verghese, Abraham 1, 2
- Vilakazi, Herbert 61
- violence
 - conceptual and bodily 155–156
 - in South African history 63
 - witch-related 109
- Vioxx case, cherry-picking of data
 - results 125
- Virchow, Rudolf 1, 73
- virus culture 156
- visual analogies
 - of disease 173–174
 - Linnaean and Darwinian divisions 176
 - racial categories and types 176
 - see also under* tree
 - Visual Analogy* (Stafford) 174
- visual art and research 173
- visual artefacts and visual knowledge bases 177
- visual memory 72
- visual technologies 86
- vitamins
 - new forms of pills 51
- supplements packaged to look like Efavirenz
 - tablet 42
 - treating HIV and AIDS 74
- vocation and profession distinction 66

- Ward, Ryk 144
- web or net iconography 177
 - as schematic of speciation 184
 - web to tree 177
 - see also* tree
- Weigel, Sigrid 158, 179
- Western medicine 2, 158
- Western philosophy 20
- Western rationalism 26
- Western science 57
- West Indies 127
- WHO (World Health Organisation) 18
 - psychosocial criteria of ARVs 21
 - wholesale biomedicalisation and political opposition 158
 - WIMSA (Working Group of Indigenous Minorities in Southern Africa) 89
 - witchcraft 82, 93, 102, 108, 109, 114
 - Wits University 72
 - degree for sangomas 60–62
 - diagnosing and treating sickness 61
 - indigenous knowledge systems programme 60
 - women's empowerment 109
 - Wonderful Life* (Gould) 176
 - Working Group of Indigenous Minorities in Southern Africa, *see* WIMSA
 - World Health Organisation, *see* WHO
 - world medicine, heterogeneous global
 - networks 162, 167
 - Wreford, Jo 57, 67
 - writing skills 71

- XDR (drug-resistant form of TB) 23
- X-rays 85, 86

- Yanomami: The Fierce Controversy and What We Can Learn from It* (Borofsky) 142
- Yanomami tribe, Amazon 4, 121, 122, 123, 145
- last human virgin soil population 140
 - measles vaccination campaign 130
 - radiation-free control group 119
 - research trip, Neel & Chagnon 130–136
- seen as link in a Darwinian chain 119

- Zambia 56
- Zapiro (Jonathan Shapiro) 57
- AIDS Science, *Mail & Guardian* cartoon 58
 - Antiretroviral roll out, *Mail & Guardian* cartoon 64
 - condemnation of medical quackery 74
 - TAC vs Matthias Rath, *Mail & Guardian* cartoon 73
- UN AIDS Conference, *Mail & Guardian* cartoon 59
- Zwelethamba township 55, 67
 - Alfred, sangoma 72
 - HIV and AIDS 63–64
 - Nandi, junior sangoma 68–69, 74
 - poverty, racial injustice, suffering 63–64
 - youths killed in apartheid struggle 63–64
- Zuma, Jacob 51